

Legal Analysis of the Position of Academic Papers in the Formulation of Regional Regulations According to the Law on the Formation of Legislation

Citra Dewi

Faculty of Law, Universitas Muhammadiyah Palu, Indonesia

✉ citradewi89@gmail.com

Abstract: The issues studied are the legal position of academic papers in the formulation of regional regulations in Indonesia and the legal implications of draft regional regulations that are not accompanied by academic papers. The aim of this research is to understand and analyze the legal position of academic papers in the formulation of regional regulations in Indonesia, as well as to analyze the legal implications of draft regulations that lack academic papers. This study uses normative legal research, examining laws, legal principles, legal theories, legal materials, and library sources. The findings show that, legally, academic papers are not merely complementary administrative documents but substantive requirements attached to the legitimacy of the process of forming regional regulations. Academic papers bridge the gap between normative needs and empirical realities. The absence of academic papers may cause formal defects in the process of forming regulations, which could result in cancellation by the central government through evaluation or annulment by the Supreme Court through judicial review.

Keywords: Academic Paper; Formulation; Regional Regulation

Received: 09 Nov, 2024

Revised: 16 Feb, 2025

Accepted: 07 Mar, 2025

Publish: 25 Mar, 2025

Publisher: Pascasarjana, Universitas Muhammadiyah Palu

INTRODUCTION

Indonesia, as one of the countries closely aligned with the civil law system, naturally relies on written law—commonly referred to as “legislation”—as its primary instrument. Legislation can be defined as any written decision issued and enacted by an authorized official, which is binding upon the public (covering laws in both the formal and material sense)¹. As the primary source of law, legislation is used in the administration of government at both the central and regional levels. At the regional level, local regulations (hereinafter referred to as perda) serve as one of the most important instruments in the implementation of regional autonomy². Perda serves as one of the tools for carrying out social and democratic transformation. From its function, perda plays an essential role in realizing welfare at the regional level. If all regions achieve prosperity, it can be ensured that the ideals and objectives of the Indonesian state as a whole will automatically be fulfilled³. Based on this, perda becomes one of the most important instruments in the implementation of regional autonomy, as stipulated in Article 18 paragraph (6) of the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia (hereinafter referred to as the 1945 Constitution), which states that “Regional governments have the right to establish regional regulations and other regulations to implement autonomy and co-administration tasks.” Pursuant to this provision, each regional government (hereinafter referred to as Pemda), whether at the provincial or regency/municipal level, is granted the authority to establish perda in carrying out its functions. Essentially, perda is a legal instrument of the regional government in implementing

¹ Gde Pantja Astawa dan Suprin Na’a, *Dinamika Hukum dan Ilmu Perundang-Undangan di Indonesia*, Bandung : Alumni, 2008, hlm. 69

² Jazim Hamidi dan Kemilau Mutik, *Legislative Drafting*, Yogyakarta : Total Media, 2011, hlm. 179-180.

³ Mesakh R. Rantepadang, Aminuddin Ilmar, Liberthin Palullungan. *Urgensi Naskah Akademik Dalam Pembentukan Peraturan Daerah Di Kota Makassar*. Paulus Journal of Research. Volume 1 Issue 2. April 2024. Hlm 15

both central government policies and its own policies⁴. Ideally, the existence of perda should be proportional in both quantity and quality. However, in reality, many perda are still far from meeting acceptable standards, often referred to as “problematic perda.” A perda is considered problematic when, first, it contradicts higher-level regulations and/or conflicts with the public interest; second, it proves ineffective in its implementation within society; third, it faces rejection from the community for being perceived as not pro-people; and fourth, it fails to support efforts to create a conducive business and investment climate in the region⁵. Based on data from the Ministry of Home Affairs (Kemendagri), in 2016 approximately 3,143 perda—including provincial, municipal, and regency regulations—were officially annulled⁶. From a budgetary perspective, problematic perda also cause financial losses, considering their large number. A report from the Directorate General of Legislation shows that problematic perda result in losses related to research costs. The drafting of a perda requires no less than IDR 300,000,000 (three hundred million rupiah). With more than 3,000 perda being annulled, this means that approximately IDR 900,000,000,000 (nine hundred billion rupiah) of funds have been wasted, not to mention the additional costs required to draft new perda to replace those that were annulled⁷.

These problems can actually be addressed by conducting in-depth scientific studies and research, so that the results can indicate whether the formulation of a perda is necessary and, if so, what kind of regulation would be ideally stipulated within the perda itself. This study and research process later developed into what is known as the Academic Paper (hereinafter referred to as NA)⁸. The Academic Paper (NA) is a crucial stage in the process of drafting a regional regulation, because the initial step in the formation of legislation—particularly regional regulations—begins with an in-depth study of a given issue in order to determine the quality of the legal product as one of the regional instruments for policymaking. As explained in Appendix I of Law Number 12 of 2011 on the Formation of Legislation, as amended by Law Number 13 of 2022 concerning the Second Amendment to Law Number 12 of 2011 on the Formation of Legislation, an NA is a document resulting from legal research or legal studies and other forms of research on a specific issue, which can be scientifically justified, concerning the regulation of that issue in a draft law or draft regional regulation, serving as a solution to legal problems and the legal needs of society⁹. Following the enactment of Law Number 13 of 2022 on the Second Amendment to Law Number 12 of 2011 on the Formation of Legislation, the existence of an Academic Paper (NA) has become a necessity. This is stipulated in Article 43 paragraph (3) of Law Number 12 of 2011 on the Formation of Legislation, as amended by Law Number 13 of 2022, which states that draft laws proposed by the President, the House of Representatives (DPR), and Regional Legislative Councils (DPRD) must be accompanied by an Academic Paper. Nevertheless, the process of drafting regional regulations (perda) still causes confusion, because it is only mentioned as an obligation accompanied by an explanation, in accordance with Article 56 paragraph (2), which provides that for draft laws or draft perda, whether at the provincial or regency/municipal level, an explanation and/or an Academic Paper must be attached.

This may create uncertainty regarding the status and importance of the Academic Paper in the drafting of regional regulation bills (Rancangan Perda). Ideally, the article would be clearer if it explicitly stated “accompanied by an Academic Paper,” without adding explanations that could carry ambiguous meanings. Article 56 paragraph (3) stipulates that draft perda accompanied only by an explanation do not require an Academic Paper. This provision suggests that an Academic Paper holds an equal position to the draft perda

⁴Fachry Ali dan Kalla, “Tepat Redam Tuntutan Reposisi”, dalam : Jazim Hamidi (ed), *Optik Hukum Bermasalah : Peraturan Daerah Bermasalah*, Jakarta : Prestasi Pustaka, 2011, hlm. 127-128.

⁵ Mahendra Putra Kurnia (et.al), *Pedoman NA Perda Partisipatif : Urgensi, Strategi, dan Proses Bagi Pembentukan Perda yang Baik (Cetakan Pertama)*, Yogyakarta : Kreasi Total Media (KTM), 2017, hlm. 30

⁶ Huma. *Kementerian Dalam Negeri*, di akses di <https://setkab.go.id/kemendagri-resmi-umumkan-3-143-perda-yang-dibatalkan/> tanggal 21 Maret 2025

⁷ Depkumham, “Laporan RAKERNIS 2009”, diakses di djpp.depukumham.go.id tanggal 21 Maret 2025

⁸ M. Roken Fadly MK, *Sifat Hukum dan Implementasi Penyusunan Naskah Akademis berdasarkan Sistem Perundang-Undangan di Indonesia*, Tesis pada Program Magister Ilmu Hukum Universitas Padjadjaran, Bandung, 2013, hlm. 6

⁹Patawari, *Teknik Pembentukan Peraturan-Perundangan*, Citra Intrans, Jakarta, 2019, Hlm.2

itself, even though the Academic Paper is the product of a legal research process, whereas an explanation is not necessarily the result of such a study¹⁰. Once the Academic Papers for draft laws (RUU) and regional regulations (Perda) have been completed, the next step is to hold discussions with the House of Representatives (DPR) or the Regional House of Representatives (DPRD). This process should be a crucial stage in determining the direction of policy to be adopted, where the in-depth and comprehensive study contained in the academic paper ought to serve as a strong scientific foundation. However, in practice, the results of such studies often do not carry significant weight. Instead of prioritizing the substance and potential impact of the policy, greater attention is frequently diverted to political considerations.

These factors often become the basis for decision-making, where the majority vote serves as the main determinant, frequently accompanied by various political interests aimed at benefiting certain groups. The consequence of this approach is that the true purpose of the academic paper is neglected, replaced by short-term interests that do not always align with the needs of society. Therefore, the drafting of regional regulations requires careful planning and prudence. The role of research and analysis prepared in the form of an Academic Paper is very important to support the drafting of regional regulations, in order to avoid potential conflicts with higher regulations or with the public interest. In addition, prior research and analysis before drafting a regional regulation can also help prevent overlaps with existing regional regulations (existing local law).

With regard to the many regional regulations that have been found problematic due to their content being considered controversial, inconsistent, and overlapping both vertically and horizontally, this is generally triggered by the heightened enthusiasm for regional autonomy, which has led to an increase in the formulation of provincial and regency/municipal regulations. However, many of these regulations have created serious problems, resulting in their annulment. Based on the above explanation, the author is interested in examining and conducting research under the title: "Legal Analysis of the Position of Academic Papers in the Formulation of Regional Regulations According to the Law on the Formation of Legislation."

METHOD

The research method used is normative legal research, namely by examining legal rules, legal principles, legal theories, legal materials, and other library sources. The author employed this method in order to study and analyze the legal rules applicable within both the constitution and positive law. The approaches applied in this research are the conceptual approach and the statutory approach. The statutory approach refers to an understanding of the hierarchy and principles within a regulation. In this context, the provisions to be examined and analyzed are the rules concerning regional head elections in Indonesia.

The conceptual approach, on the other hand, refers to perspectives and doctrines that have developed within the field of legal science, particularly in the area of constitutional law. The perspectives and doctrines employed in this study are closely related to the system of regional head elections, thereby enabling the identification of ideas that give rise to legal concepts and principles relevant to the legal issues, and thus capable of constructing legal arguments to resolve those issues.

The data analysis employed is a normative qualitative analysis method¹¹, by conducting an analysis to identify views and concepts regarding the legal position of academic manuscripts in Regional Regulations in Indonesia, the results are then synchronized to find regulations related to academic manuscripts. The data sources consist of primary, secondary, and tertiary legal materials.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The Legal Position of Academic Manuscripts in the Formulation of Regional Regulations in Indonesia

One of the components of a state governed by law is that all government actions must be based on existing laws and regulations. The administration of the state is not solely based on the will of those in power; rather, the government operates in accordance with pre-established laws, and the authorities are required to

¹⁰ Annisa Pratiwi dkk, *Kedudukan dan Kegunaan Naskah Akademik dalam Perencanaan Pembentukan Peraturan Daerah*, Innovative: Journal of Social Science Research, Vol.3, No.3(2023), Hlm.3.

¹¹ Aminuddin Ilmar. 2009. *Konstruksi Teori dan Metode Kajian Ilmu Hukum*. Hasanuddin University Press : Makassar., hlm. 87-88

comply with these laws¹². As is known, the law has a rigid nature. Therefore, as a state governed by law, every regulation must be amended to follow the development of the times, a process known as legal development. Comprehensive legal development involves the substance of the law, legal institutions, and legal culture, accompanied by firm and consistent law enforcement while still respecting human rights. This enables the law to function as a tool for reform and development, as well as an instrument for resolving problems fairly and regulating societal behavior in respecting the law¹³.

Jimly Asshiddiqie stated that the legal norms to be included in a draft of legislation should be formulated with careful consideration and deep reflection, solely for the benefit of the general public, not for the interests of specific individuals or groups¹⁴. Therefore, legislation functions as a direct guide in law enforcement and societal behavior. Legislation in Indonesia serves as a reflection of the implementation of the rule of law concept promoted by the country's founders. With clear and well-structured regulations, society can conduct civic life based on order, justice, and legal certainty. Furthermore, effective legislation also serves as an instrument of social control, which indirectly encourages the growth of a legal culture that supports a better national and civic life.

An academic manuscript is an important instrument in the process of drafting legislation, particularly Regional Regulations (Perda), as it serves as a deep conceptual foundation that can be scientifically accountable. This document integrates philosophical, sociological, and juridical studies to ensure that the regulations formulated truly align with societal needs, the core values of the state, and the prevailing legal order.

Although normatively, the position of the academic manuscript in Perda formation is often still considered facultative or open to multiple interpretations, as reflected in various laws such as Law No. 12 of 2011 and its amendments, its preparation has not yet become an explicit obligation. As a result, in practice across many regions, academic manuscripts are often neglected, which affects the quality of regulations, leads to the creation of non-implementable norms, and can even result in the annulment of regulations due to conflicts with higher-level laws. In fact, academic manuscripts can reduce excessive political intervention and ensure public involvement and transparency in the legislative process.

In its position, the academic manuscript functions not only as a tool for scientific legitimacy and a limitation of authority, but also as a bridge between the academic world, the government, and society. It provides objective arguments regarding the urgency of a regulation, its scope and policy direction, as well as the legal basis underpinning it. Thus, regional regulations drafted with the support of an academic manuscript are not only of higher substantive quality but also have a greater likelihood of being accepted, complied with, and effectively implemented by the public. Although it has not yet become a normative requirement in every stage of Perda formulation, functionally and substantively, the academic manuscript is an urgent necessity that should be integrated into the regional legislative process to create regulations that are fair, applicable, and in line with constitutional values as well as the social realities of society.

Legal Implications of Draft Regional Regulations Not Accompanied by an Academic Manuscript

To achieve an effective legal system, it is necessary to organize legal institutions supported by the quality of human resources, a culture and awareness of the law among the public that continues to grow, and accompanied by structured updates to legal materials in accordance with the evolving needs of society. Law plays a very vital role because it is a legitimate regulatory tool in a state governed by law, as Indonesia is known to be a state based on law. Therefore, law has a coercive nature to ensure order, justice, and certainty

¹²Ilham Singgih Prakoso, *Eksistensi dan Fungsi Naskah Akademik Pembentukan Peraturan Perundang-Undangan*, Jurnal Kajian Hukum, Vol.6, No.1 (2021), Hlm.2

¹³Putera Astomo, *Ilmu Perundang-Undangan : Teori dan Praktik di Indonesia*, Rajawali Pers, Depok, 2018, Hlm.71

¹⁴Bakillani, Mukhlis, dan Yusrizal, *Keberadaan Naskah Akademik dalam Pembentukan Qanun Aceh*, Suloh : Jurnal Fakultas Hukum Universitas Malikussaleh, Vol.10, No.1 (2022), Hlm.3.

in society. Consequently, the law serves as both a regulator and enforcer for society, a concept often referred to as law is a tool of social engineering¹⁵.

During the democratic transition period, the presence of an academic manuscript becomes essential. This is emphasized by Ann and Robert Siedman in their book *Legislative Drafting for Democratic Social Change*, where they state that in the process of drafting legislation, research and the concept paper are indispensable. Therefore, the academic manuscript serves as an effort to explain more transparently to all stakeholders the significance of a regional regulation.

In the process of drafting a regional regulation, the academic manuscript represents a portrait or map of various issues that need to be addressed or solved through the regulation to be enacted. Some characteristic features of an academic manuscript include: 1) Systematic: It is organized neatly and structurally, from the introduction, literature review, methodology, analysis, to the conclusion. 2) Argumentative: It contains logical arguments based on relevant facts and data. 3) Referential: Its preparation refers to academic sources and previous research to support the arguments presented. 4) Objective: It presents information objectively without personal bias from the author¹⁶.

As previously explained, the academic manuscript can function as a comparative reference in the planning process during the drafting of Regional Regulations (Perda) at the regency/city level. Furthermore, the position of the academic manuscript in the formulation process of Regional Regulations serves as a scientific foundation to support data-driven and objectively analyzed decision-making, reflecting public participation and incorporating predetermined regulatory content.

The structure of an academic manuscript includes:

Chapter I – Introduction

Chapter II – Theoretical Review and Empirical Practice

Chapter III – Evaluation and Analysis of Related Legislation

Chapter IV – Philosophical, Sociological, and Juridical Basis

Chapter V – Scope, Regulatory Direction, and Material Coverage of Laws, Provincial Regulations, or Regency/City Regulations

Chapter VI – Conclusion

In Law No. 13 of 2022, a method for preparing academic manuscripts was added. Specifically, in Chapter II, letter D, which concerns the study of the implications of implementing a new system regulated in a Law or Regional Regulation on aspects of community life and its impact on state financial burdens, it is required to conduct an analysis using the Regulatory Impact Analysis (RIA) method and the Rule, Opportunity, Capacity, Communication, Interest, Process, and Ideology (ROCCIPI) method¹⁷. The methods of analysis used in preparing academic manuscripts have evolved over time, driven by societal regulatory needs and the financial burdens on the state. The academic manuscript serves as a critical foundation in the drafting of regional regulations, yet it is often overlooked in local legislative practice. Without the support of an academic manuscript, a draft regional regulation is like a building without a solid foundation—it may stand temporarily but is vulnerable to legal challenges and political changes. In a rule-of-law state, the absence of an academic manuscript creates a void of scientific justification that should serve as a bridge between state power and citizens' rights. Legislative processes without an academic manuscript essentially constitute a misuse of legislative authority, as they eliminate rational control mechanisms over public policy.

The most apparent implication of the absence of an academic manuscript is reflected in court decisions that annul various regional regulations due to formal defects. However, the more dangerous impact is systemic—the weakening of rational legal culture at the local level and the strengthening of tendencies to use regulations merely as instruments of power. Without an academic manuscript, regional regulations lose their

¹⁵Ergina Faralita. *Konsekuensi Hukum Terhadap Tidak Disertakannya Naskah Akademik Dalam Pembentukan Peraturan Perundangan-Undangan*. Vol. 10 No. 02 Agustus 2022. Hlm 431

¹⁶Suska, Prinsip Regulatory Impact Assessment dalam Proses Penyusunan Peraturan Perundang-Undangan Sesuai UU Nomor 12 Tahun 2011, *Jurnal Konstitusi*, Vol.9, No.2 (2022), Hlm.367.

¹⁷Ihsanul Maarif dan Firdaus Arifin, *Komparasi Penggunaan Analisis Regulatory Method Sebagai Instrumen Pendukung Kebijakan Dalam Penyusunan Peraturan Perundang-Undangan*, *Jurnal Litigasi*, Vol.23, No.2 (2022), Hlm.272.

scientific essence and become political documents easily altered with changes in local leadership. In the long term, this practice undermines the national legal order by creating unplanned and poorly coordinated local regulatory frameworks.

Based on the above, every draft regional regulation should be accompanied by an academic manuscript, because without it, the following implications arise:

Procedural Defects

Procedures are part of accountability in the formulation of regional regulations. When a regional regulation follows all stages as required, the process has high accountability to the public. However, if certain stages are omitted, the process loses its accountability value. Following proper procedures is an inseparable part of public accountability in a democratic state.

According to Articles 56 and 57 of Law No. 12 of 2011 on the Formation of Legislation, draft provincial regulations may originate from the Provincial DPRD or the Governor. These drafts must be accompanied by explanations and/or an academic manuscript. However, for drafts concerning: the Provincial Revenue and Expenditure Budget; the repeal of provincial regulations; or amendments limited to a few provisions, it is sufficient to include an explanation containing the main ideas and regulated material.

Before the enactment of Law No. 12 of 2011, the legal norms were prepared in the form of draft laws. Draft laws can be categorized into three types: first, academic drafts or academic manuscripts; second, political drafts, which carry political weight for involved parties; and third, juridical drafts, which have legal value.

Therefore, regional regulations without an academic manuscript are considered procedurally defective, violating the provisions on legislative formation. The academic manuscript is an essential document explaining the scientific basis and urgency of a regulation.

Substantive Defects

Substantive defects in constitutional law refer to deficiencies or incompleteness in the content of legislation, which may render it invalid or ineffective. Substantive defects can arise from unclear norms, inconsistency with higher legal principles, or lack of thorough study during drafting.

According to Jimly Asshiddiqie, an Indonesian constitutional law expert, substantive defects are deficiencies in legal norms that make them ineffective. He emphasizes that all legislation must meet substantive requirements: it must be clear, not conflict with higher regulations, and be based on thorough study. If not, the regulation may be considered substantively defective and potentially annulled by the court.

In practice, substantive defects can critically affect a regulation's validity. For example, a regional regulation without an adequate academic manuscript may be considered substantively defective. The academic manuscript provides the scientific basis and justification for the regulation. The legal basis for requiring an academic manuscript in regional regulation formation is provided in Law No. 12 of 2011, Article 56(2), which states that draft regulations must be accompanied by explanations and/or an academic manuscript.

The academic manuscript plays a crucial role in regional regulation (Perda) formation as the scientific and rational foundation of the legislative process. Failing to include it renders the legal product vulnerable to procedural and substantive defects, potentially leading to annulment. Previously, the annulment of Perda was handled by the executive—by the Minister of Home Affairs for provincial regulations and governors for regency/city regulations—through a process known as executive review, which serves as central oversight over local regulations to maintain legal coherence and ensure justice and certainty. This is regulated in Law No. 23 of 2014 and Ministry of Home Affairs Regulation No. 80 of 2015.

A turning point occurred with Constitutional Court Decisions No. 137/PUU-XIII/2015 and 56/PUU-XIV/2016, which removed the annulment authority from the Minister of Home Affairs and governors, transferring it entirely to the Supreme Court. These decisions emphasized that Perda, as legislative products, should be reviewed through judicial review, not executive review. Consequently, only the Supreme Court now has the authority to annul Perda that conflict with higher legislation. This ruling ended long-standing debates, clarified the legal system, strengthened regional autonomy, and guaranteed protection of the national legal order.

CONCLUSION

The legal position of academic manuscripts is explicitly regulated in various laws, particularly in Law No. 12 of 2011 on the Formation of Legislation, as amended by Law No. 13 of 2022. These regulations stipulate that every draft regional regulation originating from the executive must be accompanied by an academic manuscript, except for limited amendments. Consequently, legally, the academic manuscript is not merely an administrative supporting document but a substantive requirement integral to the legitimacy of the regional regulation formation process. The academic manuscript bridges normative needs and empirical conditions in the field.

The absence of an academic manuscript can result in formal defects in the drafting of a Perda. This has implications for the potential annulment of draft regulations by the central government through the evaluation mechanism, or even the annulment of enacted Perda by the Supreme Court through judicial review. Furthermore, the lack of an academic manuscript may lead to the drafting of Perda that is not data-driven, not participatory, and does not accurately address the legal needs of the community. Consequently, the resulting Perda tends to be purely normative-textual, without considering the social, economic, and cultural conditions that should serve as the basis for local legal policy.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books

- Abdul Wahab Solichin, *Analisis Kebijakan*. Jakarta: PT. Bumi Aksara, 2015
- Fachry Ali dan Kalla, *"Tepat Redam Tuntutan Reposisi"*, dalam: Jazim Hamidi (ed), *Optik Hukum Bermasalah: Peraturan Daerah Bermasalah*, Jakarta: Prestasi Pustaka, 2011
- Harry Alexander, *Panduan Rancangan Undang-Undang di Indonesia*, Jakarta XSYS Solusindo, 2014.
- Irfan Fachruddin, *Pengawasan Peradilan Administrasi terhadap Tindakan Pemerintah*, Alumni, Bandung, 2014.
- Indrohato, *Asas-Asas Umum Pemerintahan yang baik, dalam Paulus Efendie Lotulung, Himpunan Makalah Asas-Asas Umum Pemerintahan yang baik*, Citra Aditya Bakti, Bandung, 2015.
- Jazim Hamidi dan Kemilau Mutik, *Legislative Drafting*, Yogyakarta: Total Media, 2011.
- Jimly Asshiddiqie, *Perihal Undang-Undang*, Jakarta: Konstitusi Press dan PT Syaami Cipta Media, 2018.
- Jazim Hamidi dan Kemilau Mutik, *Legislative Drafting*, Yogyakarta: Total Media, 2016.
- King Faisal Sulaiman, *Teori Peraturan Perundang-undangan dan Aspek Pengujiannya*, Yogyakarta: Thafa Media, 2017.
- Miriam Budiardjo, *Dasar-dasar Ilmu Politik*, Jakarta, Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2011.
- Mahendra Putra Kurnia (et.al), *Pedoman NA Perda Partisipatif: Urgensi, Strategi, dan Proses Bagi Pembentukan Perda yang Baik (Cetakan Pertama)*, Yogyakarta: Kreasi Total Media (KTM), 2017.
- Maria Farida Indriani S, *Ilmu Perundang-Undangan Proses dan Teknik Pembentukannya*, Yogyakarta, Kansius. 2018.
- Mukti Fajar ND dan Yulianto Achmad. *Dualisme penelitian Hukum, Normatif dan Empiris*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar. 2013.
- Patawari, *Teknik Pembentukan Peraturan-Perundangan*, Citra Intrans, Jakarta, 2019.
- Prajudi Atmosudirjo, *Hukum Administrasi Negara*, Jakarta, Ghalia Indonesia, 2018.
- Philipus M. Hadjon, *Perlindungan Hukum Bagi Rakyat di Indonesia, Sebuah Studi tentang Prinsip-prinsipnya, Penanganannya oleh Pengadilan Dalam Lingkungan Peradilan Umum dan Pembentukan Peradilan Administrasi, Peradaban*, Surabaya. 2007.
- Putera Astomo, *Ilmu Perundang-undangan*, Jakarta: Rajawali Pers, 2018.
- Ridwan HR, *Hukum Administrasi Negara*, Cetakan ke-8. PT. Raja Grafindo Persada, Jakarta, 2016
- _____, *Hukum Administrasi Negara*, Cetakan ke-14, Rajawali Press, Jakarta, 2018.
- Rosjidi Ranggawidjaja, *Pengantar Ilmu Perundang-undangan Indonesia*. Bandung: Mandar Maju, 20018.
- Satjipto Rahardjo, *Ilmu Hukum*, cetakan ke2. Bandung: PT Citra Aditya, 2014

Journals

- Annisa Pratiwi dkk, *Kedudukan dan Kegunaan Naskah Akademik dalam Perencanaan Pembentukan Peraturan Daerah*, Innovative : Journal Of Social Science Research, Vol.3, No.3(2023),
- _____, *Urgensi Penegakan Hukum Dalam Hidup Berbangsa Dan Bernegara*, Jurnal El-Afkar, Vol. 5 No.2 Tahun 2016
- Mesakh R. Rantepadang, Aminuddin Ilmar, Liberthin Palullungan. *Urgensi Naskah Akademik Dalam Pembentukan Peraturan Daerah Di Kota Makassar*. Paulus Journal of Research. Volume 1 Issue 2. April 2024.
- Philipus M. Hadjon, "Tentang Wewenang", Jurnal Pro Justisia, Yuridika, No .5 dan 6 tahun XII, September – Desember, 2013
- Sari Nugraha, *Problematika Dalam Pengujian dan Pembatalan Perda Oleh Pemerintah Pusat*, Jurnal Hukum Bisnis, Vol. 23, No. 1, 2014
- Wahyu Nugroho, *Menyusun Undang-Undang yang Responsif dan Partisipatif Berdasarkan Cita Hukum Pancasila*, Jurnal Legislasi Indonesia, Vol. 10, No. 3