# **Comparative Analysis of The Performance of Syariah Mutual Funds With Conventional Funds**

(Case Study of equity mutual funds and fixed income mutual funds listed on the IDX (Indonesia Stock Exchange) in 2016-2018)

Mujahid<sup>(1\*)</sup>, Rachmat Sugeng<sup>(2)</sup>, Yasir<sup>(3)</sup> Syamsul Riyadi<sup>(4)</sup>, Karima<sup>(5)</sup>

<sup>1,2,3,4,5</sup> Faculty of Economics and Social Sciences, Universitas Fajar Makassar \*Corresponding Author, Email: <u>mujahid@unifa.ac.id</u>

#### ABSTRACT

In carrying out investment activities, it is to seek a profit and expect the invested funds to be stored safely and can be retrieved quickly if they want to be needed again, Mutual funds are a new investment vehicle that has minimized risks because the funds that have been collected can be invested in various types of investment vehicles, such as bonds, stocks and money market instruments. In this study aims to determine the "comparative analysis of the performance of Islamic mutual funds with conventional mutual funds through equity mutual funds and fixed income mutual funds.

Keywords - Islamic stock mutual funds, Conventional stock mutual funds

#### **INTRODUCTION**

The stock and bond market conditions have been under pressure since the beginning of 2018 so that several investment products have recorded negative returns. However, a number of the best Islamic mutual funds available on the Bareksa Investment Marketplace were able to record profits, some even far exceeding the benchmark index. The Composite Stock Price Index (IHSG), as a reference for the Indonesian capital market, is still under pressure if calculated since the beginning of the year. Mutual funds as an investment were first recognized in Indonesia by referring to the regulation of the Minister of Finance Declaration No.1548 of 1990. However, this regulation is not sufficient to encourage the development of mutual funds itself because only closed-type mutual fund businesses are permitted (close-ended). Then after the passing of Law No.8 of 1995 which regulates capital market activities in Indonesia, opportunities for the establishment of open-ended mutual funds, in the form of Collective Investment Contracts (KIK) are increasingly open.

Mutual funds as an investment were first recognized in Indonesia by referring to the regulation of the Minister of Finance Declaration No.1548 of 1990. However, this regulation is not sufficient to encourage the development of mutual funds itself because only closed-type mutual fund businesses are allowed (close-ended). Then after the passing of Law No.8

of 1995 which regulates capital market activities in Indonesia, opportunities for the establishment of open-ended mutual funds, in the form of Collective Investment Contracts (KIK) are increasingly open.

The growth in the number of Sharia mutual fund products exceeded that of conventional mutual fund products. In contrast, the number of Syariah mutual funds products throughout 2018 grew 18.3 per cent from 224 products to 265, while traditional mutual fund products only grew 2.19 per cent from 1,875 to 1,916 products. So the total number of mutual fund products grew 3.91% from 2,099 products in 2016 to 2,181 works, while overall mutual fund products grew 1.36 from 1,289 products in 2017 to 1,595.

Year	Syariah mutual funds Number of products	Conventional Mutual Funds Number of Products
2016	2.099	2.181
2017	1.289	1.595.
2018	224	1.875
2019	265	1.916
Jumlah	3.877	7.567

## Tabel 1. Sharia mutual funds with conventional mutual funds

Source: Processed data

Based on the table above, the number of conventional mutual fund products increased more than sharia mutual funds in 2016-2018. However, this research focuses more on stock mutual funds and fixed income mutual funds, both sharia and conventional. It has a relatively lower risk with the aim of investing in producing a stable return. The return and risk that will be received remain the first consideration for investors to invest. Muslim investors are no exception in deciding to invest.

# METHODOLOGY

## **Research Design**

This research is a quantitative research using descriptive analysis method. Descriptive study is research that aims to describe the phenomena found in the form of either a factor or risk or an effect of the results. The data of this study are presented with an analysis of how this phenomenon can occur, in this descriptive research method to try to describe how the comparative analysis of the performance of conventional mutual funds and sharia mutual funds (case studies of equity mutual funds and fixed income mutual funds listed on the Indonesia Stock Exchange (IDX) in 2016-2018.

#### Location and Time of Research

The time of this research will be (2) two months, namely in June - August and located with the coverage of several places or UKM in Makassar City.

#### Data source

Secondary data is a source of data obtained by the author indirectly through intermediary media. In this case, the data obtained is through reference books as well as from the internet. The secondary data source in this study is information related to the object of this research in the form of books, papers, and writings or journals related to the item of research. The data used in the study is monthly Net Asset Value (NAV) data for the 2016-2018 period obtained from www.Ojk.co.id obtained from http://www.infovesta.com as well as some other mutual fund information obtained from the address http : // www.idx.co.id and from www.bareksa.com.

#### **Population and Sample**

The sample in this study used is taking side purposive, and the sampling technique of data sources with certain considerations.

#### Tabel 2. Sample Reksadana

No	Sampel Reksadana	Syariah	Konvensional
1 9	Saham Syariah	4	10
2 F	Pendapatan Tetap Syariah	6	7
Course	an Drangened data		

Source: Processed data

#### **Data Collection Technique**

The method used in this analysis is a quantitative analysis of the available data. The data obtained is then processed by formulas by the definition of the operational variable. Meanwhile, to assess the performance of Islamic mutual funds using the Sharpe method, the Treynor and Jensen method. To achieve the objectives in conducting this research, the analysis method used in several stages, namely:

Calculating the rate of return of each mutual fund return is the result obtained from the investment. Returns can be in the form of realized (real) returns that have occurred or expected returns that have not occurred but are expected to happen in the future. Calculating the return realization can use the following formula:

$$R_t = \frac{NAB_t - NAB_{t-1}}{NAB_{t-1}}$$

Where :

Rt = Rate of Return on Investment NABt = NAB of the current month NABt-1 = NAB last month (1) Calculating the level of risk for each mutual fund and market risk Looking for mutual fund investment risks and market risks using the standard deviation formula as follows:

Where :

α = standard deviationRi = back to iR = average of multiplication

N = number of observations

(2) Calculating the Risk Free Return

$$Rf = \frac{R1 \mp R2t + Rnt}{N}$$

Where :

Rf = Risk-Free Investment R1t, R2t Rnt = interest rate in the observation period N = Number of comparative observation periods

- (3) Measurement of mutual fund performance using several methods:
  - a. Sharpe Method Sharpe measurement is formulated as the ratio risk premium to the standard deviation:

SRD= 
$$\frac{Kinerja_{RD-Kinerja_{RF}}}{\beta}$$

Where :

SRD = shape ratio value Performance RD = average mutual fund performance for a certain sub-period RE performance = average risk-free investment performance for a certain sub-period  $\sigma$  = standard deviation of mutual funds for a certain sub-period b. Treynor Method Measurement using the Treynor method is as follows

$$SRD = \frac{Kinerja_{RD-Kinerja_{Rf}}}{\beta}$$

Where :

SRD = shape ratio value

Performance RD = average mutual fund performance for a certain sub-period RE performance = average risk-free investment performance for a certain sub-period  $\sigma$  = standard deviation of mutual funds for a certain sub-period

c. Jensen's Method The formulations put forward by Jensen are:

 $\alpha = \frac{kinerja_{RD} - kinerja_{RF}}{kinerjaP}$ 

Where : Alfa = Jensen Cut Value RD performance = mutual fund performance Performance RF = Risk free investment performance Performance P = Market performance B = Slope of the linear regression equation

The data analysis technique used in this research is descriptive statistics. Statistical methods are generally used in the sample group tested in terms of the difference in the average count which consists of 2 groups, namely utilising the T-test, independent T-test statistical technique to compare the performance of equity funds and the performance of Islamic fixed income mutual funds and the performance of equity mutual funds. And the performance of conventional fixed income mutual funds.

## **RESULT & DISCUSSION**

Based on research conducted by researchers on the Comparative Analysis of the Performance of Sharia Mutual Funds with Conventional Mutual Funds (case studies of Equity Mutual Funds and Fixed Income Mutual Funds listed on the Indonesia Stock Exchange (IDX) in 2016-2018) ". Research conducted by researchers on the Comparison of the Performance of Islamic Mutual Funds with Conventional Mutual Funds, then the results obtained are as follows :

		Sharpe			
Reksadana	Jenis Reksadana	Tahun Periode			
		2016	2017	2018	
1. BNP Paribas Pesona Syariah	SS	5143	7794	-3,136	
2. Manulife Syariah Sektoral Amanah	SS	5655	0		
3. Maybank Syariah Equity Fund	SS	5159	-1,499		
4.HPM Syariah Ekuitas	SS		8146		
Jumlah		5319	3,610	-3,136	

# Sharia Mutual Fund Shares Method

Sumber : diolah peneliti

Published by : Universitas Muhammadiyah

	Tanta	Sharpe			
Reksadana	Jenis Reksadana	Tahun Periode			
	Tecksadana	2016	2017	2018	
1. BNI-AM Inspiring Equity Fund	SK	788	46,224	-42,397	
2. BNP Paribas Ekuitas	SK	206	55089	-29,720	
3. BNP Paribas Infrastruktur Plus	SK	3886	63211	-21,496	
4. BNP Paribas Pesona	SK	2862	47579	-26,975	
5. BNP Paribas Solaris	SK	4688	29262	7714	
6. Batavia Dana Saham	SK	3264	66159	-13,384	
7. Batavia Dana Saham Optimal	SK	2970	46606		
8. Danareksa Mawar Konsumer 10	SK	2953	71925	-24,839	
9. HPAM Ultima Ekuitas 1	SK	10418	48073	9646	
10. Mandiri Investa Cerdas Bangsa	SK	32035	474,128	-141,451	
Jumlah		6407	94,826	-31,434	
Sumbar , dialah Davaliti					

**Conventional Mutual Fund Shares Method.** 

Sumber : diolah Peneliti

Syariah Equity Mutual Funds have a Sharpe value in 2016 of 5319, in addition to that, Islamic equity funds in 2017 had an amount of 3,610, while Islamic stock mutual funds in 2018 had a Sharpe value of -3,136. Sharia stock mutual funds totalled 4 samples valued at 27,262, So Islamic stock mutual funds have an average Sharpe value of 1931.

While the performance of conventional stock mutual funds has a Sharpe Value in the 2016 period of 64070, besides, traditional stock mutual funds in the 2017 period amounted to 94,826 while traditional stock mutual funds in the 2018 period had a Sharpe Value of - 31,434. There are ten samples of traditional mutual funds valued at 69,799. So Conventional Equity Mutual Funds have an average Sharpe value of 94.826.

		J000	03211	-21,470
4. BNP Paribas Pesona	SK	2862	47579	-26,975
5. BNP Paribas Solaris	SK	4688	29262	7714
6. Batavia Dana Saham	SK	3264	66159	-13,384
7. Batavia Dana Saham Optimal	SK	2970	46606	
8. Danareksa Mawar Konsumer 10	SK	2953	71925	-24,839
9. HPAM Ultima Ekuitas 1	SK	10418	48073	9646
10. Mandiri Investa Cerdas Bangsa	SK	32035	474,128	-141,451
Jumlah		6407	94,826	-31,434

Sharia Mutual Fund Shares Jensen Method

Sumber : diolah Peneliti

		Sharpe			
Reksadana	Jenis Reksadana	Tahun Periode			
	TCKSadana	2016	2017	2018	
1. BNI-AM Inspiring Equity Fund	SK	788	46,224	-42,397	
2. BNP Paribas Ekuitas	SK	206	55089	-29,720	
3. BNP Paribas Infrastruktur Plus	SK	3886	63211	-21,496	
4. BNP Paribas Pesona	SK	2862	47579	-26,975	
5. BNP Paribas Solaris	SK	4688	29262	7714	
6. Batavia Dana Saham	SK	3264	66159	-13,384	
7. Batavia Dana Saham Optimal	SK	2970	46606		
8. Danareksa Mawar Konsumer 10	SK	2953	71925	-24,839	
9. HPAM Ultima Ekuitas 1	SK	10418	48073	9646	
10. Mandiri Investa Cerdas Bangsa	SK	32035	474,128	-141,451	
Jumlah		6407	94,826	-31,434	
Sumber : diolah Peneliti					

## The Jensen Method of Conventional Mutual Funds.

. . . . . . .

Syariah equity mutual funds had a Jensen value in 2016 of 746, in addition to that, Islamic stock mutual funds in 2017 had a value of 100, while Islamic equity funds in 2018 had a Jensen value of -1,180. Sharia equity mutual funds totalled 4 samples valued at -334. So the performance of stock mutual funds has an average Jensen value of -111.

Whereas the performance of conventional stock mutual funds has a Jensen Value in the 2016 period of 556, in addition to that, traditional stock mutual funds in the 2017 period amounted to 1270, while conventional stock mutual funds in the 2018 period had a Jensen Value of 840.78. Traditional stock mutual funds totalled ten samples of 2667, so with traditional stock mutual funds have an average Jensen value of.

	Tente	Sharpe			
Reksadana	Reksadana	Tahun Periode			
	ICERSOCIATIO	2016	2017	2018	
1.Bahana Mes Syariah Fund	PTS	0	142,427	-10,047	
2. MNC Dana Syariah	PTS	17,564	0	-9,952	
3. Mandiri Investa Syariah	PTS	9257	338,961	-19,567	
4. Eastspiring Syariah Fixed Income	PTS	0	76,536	-5,959	
5. Manulife Syariah Sukuk Indonesia	PTS	0	0	-17,741	
6.Reksadana Syariah majoris Sukuk	PTS	0	0	-13,477	
Jumlah		4,470	92,987	-12,791	
Sumber : diolah peneliti					

Sharia Mutual Fund Fixed Income Sharpe Method

Published by : Universitas Muhammadiyah

	Taula	Sharpe			
Reksadana	Reksadana	Tahun Periode			
	Iteksudullu	2016	2017	2018	
1.BNP Paribas prima II Kelas RK 1	PTK	3361	118,424	-68,044	
2. Manulife Obligasi Negara Indonesia	РТК	5713	135,910	-67,532	
3. Schroder Dana Andalan	PTK	-9,452	-10,697	-224,911	
4.Schroder Dana Mantap Plus II	PTK	5798	110,119	-69,573	
5. Manulife Obligasi unggulan	PTK	0	142,329	-53,373	
6. Manulife Pendapatan Bulanan	PTK	0	-18,514	-199,159	
7.Reksadana Kahati Letari	PTK	0	98,900	-70,528	
Jumlah		774	82,353	-107,589	

## Sharpe's Assessment Method on Conventional Mutual Fund Fixed Income.

Sumber : diolah peneliti

Sharia fixed income mutual funds are Sharpe value Sharia fixed income mutual funds have a Net Asset Value (NAV) in 2016 of 4,470, besides that Fixed Income mutual funds in 2017 had a value of 92,987, while Fixed Income mutual funds in 2018 had a Sharpe Value of -12,791. There are six samples of sharia fixed income mutual funds totalling 84.667, so conventional fixed-income performance has an average Sharpe value of 84.667.

Conventional fixed income mutual funds in 2016 amounted to 774, besides traditional Fixed income mutual funds in 2017 amounted to 82,353 while traditional Fixed Income mutual funds in 2018 had a Sharpe value of -107,589. Traditional fixed income mutual funds worth -24,461. So traditional Fixed Income mutual funds have an average Sharpe value of -8.154.

D-los loss	Tanta	Sharpe			
Reksadana	Jenis Reksadana	Tahun Periode			
	Texsadana	2016	2017	2018	
1. BNI-AM Inspiring Equity Fund	SK	788	46,224	-42,397	
2. BNP Paribas Ekuitas	SK	206	55089	-29,720	
3. BNP Paribas Infrastruktur Plus	SK	3886	63211	-21,496	
4. BNP Paribas Pesona	SK	2862	47579	-26,975	
5. BNP Paribas Solaris	SK	4688	29262	7714	
6. Batavia Dana Saham	SK	3264	66159	-13,384	
7. Batavia Dana Saham Optimal	SK	2970	46606		
8. Danareksa Mawar Konsumer 10	SK	2953	71925	-24,839	
9. HPAM Ultima Ekuitas 1	SK	10418	48073	9646	
10. Mandiri Investa Cerdas Bangsa	SK	32035	474,128	-141,451	
Jumlah		6407	94,826	-31,434	
Sumher · diolah Peneliti					

## **Treynor Method on Fixed Income Sharia Mutual Funds**

Published by : <u>Universitas Muhammadiyah</u>

	T	Ireynor			
Reksadana	Reksadana	Tahun Periode			
Reksadali		2016	2017	2018	
1.BNP Paribas prima II Kelas RK 1	PTK	969,259	3245	-2,410	
2. Manulife Obligasi Negara Indonesia	PTK	211,833	3305	-2,256	
3. Schroder Dana Andalan	PTK	-659,555	9709	-33,979	
4. Schroder Dana Mantap Plus II	PTK	192,714	3382	-2,357	
5. Manulife Obligasi unggulan	PTK	0	3455	-3,050	
6. Manulife Pendapatan Bulanan	PTK	0	749	-16,264	
7.Reksadana Kahati Letari	PTK	0	2999	-2,809	
Jumlah		102,036	3,835	-9,018	

#### Treynor Method on Fixed Income Shares of Conventional Mutual Funds.

Sumber : diolah peneliti

Syariah Fixed Income Mutual Funds Treynor Value Sharia Fixed Income Mutual Funds have a Treynor Value in 2016 of -342,813, besides that Fixed Income mutual funds in 2017 had a value of 43,279, while Fixed Income mutual funds in 2018 were -3,251. There are six sharia fixed income mutual funds valued at -302,785 and have an average Sharpe value of -100,928.

While the performance of conventional Fixed Income mutual funds has a Treynor Value in the 2016 period of 102,036, in addition to that of the traditional Fixed Income Mutual Funds in the 2017 period of 3,835 while conventional Fixed Income Mutual Funds in 2018 amounted to -9,018, traditional fixed income mutual funds amounted to 7, valued at 96,853. and has an average Sharpe value of 32,284.

		Jensen			
Reksadana	Jenis Reksadana	Tahun Periode			
		2016	2017	2018	
1.Bahana Mes Syariah Fund	PTS	0	4750	-3,913	
2. MNC Dana Syariah	PTS	-4,335	0	-3,947	
3. Mandiri Investa Syariah	PTS	-2,511	-5,849	2710	
4. Eastspiring Syariah Fixed Income	PTS		4437	-6,433	
5. Manulife Syariah Sukuk Indonesia	PTS		0	-9,587	
6.Reksadana Syariah majoris Sukuk	PTS		0	-6,400	
Jumlah		-2,282	556	-4,595	

# Jensen method on Fixed Income Sharia Mutual Funds

Sumber : diolah peneliti

	Tente	Jensen				
Reksadana	Jenis Reksadana	I	Tahun Periode			
	Reksadana	2016	2017	2018		
1.BNP Paribas prima II Kelas RK 1	PTK	3854	3909	-2,777		
2. Manulife Obligasi Negara Indonesia	РТК	7484	3872	-2,613		
3. Schroder Dana Andalan	PTK	8719	17,781	19,541		
4.Schroder Dana Mantap Plus II	PTK	5955	4149	-2,765		
5. Manulife Obligasi unggulan	PTK	0	4086	-3,050		
6. Manulife Pendapatan Bulanan	PTK	0	1749	-16,264		
7.Reksadana Kahati Letari	PTK	0	3466	-2,809		
Jumlah		4335	5,573	-1,534		

Jensen's Method in Conventional Fixed Income Mutual Funds

Sumber :diolah peneliti

Syariah Fixed Income Mutual Funds Jensen Value Syariah Fixed Income Mutual Funds have a Jensen Value in 2016 of -2,282, in addition to that, fixed income mutual funds in 2017 had a value of 556, while fixed income mutual funds in 2018 were -4,595. There are six samples of Islamic fixed income mutual funds valued at 6,321 and have an average Jensen value of -2,107.

Meanwhile, conventional fixed income mutual funds have a Jensen Value in the 2016 period of 4335. Also, traditional fixed income mutual funds in the 2017 period amounted to 5.573 while conventional fixed income mutual funds in the 2018 period had a Jensen Value of 1.534. There are seven samples of traditional fixed income mutual funds valued at 8.375, so conventional has an average Jensen value of 2.792.

## **Paired Sample T-test**

The pired sample T-test or T test is used to see whether there is a significant difference between the two independent samples at the level ( $\alpha$ ) assuming the data is normally distributed. The two samples are said to be significantly different if the significant value is smaller than ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ).

•									
		Paired Differences					Т	df	Sig. (2-
		Mean Std. Deviatio n		Std. Error Mean	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference				tailed)
					Lower	Upper			
Pair 1	REKSADAN A SAHAM - PENDAPAT AN TETAP	13534,201	90897,48 4	21424,74	- 31668,055	58736,45 6	,632	17	,536

Paired Samples Test

sumber: Hasil Olah Data SPSS 21, 2020

From the table above, it is known that the significant value (Sig. 2-tailed) is 0.536> 0.05, it can be concluded that there is no significant difference between Islamic equity funds and conventional equity funds and fixed income Islamic mutual funds and traditional mutual funds.

Hypothesis testing for H1 was carried out using the Paired sample t-test difference test with a significance level of  $\alpha = 0.05$  for two independent samples and to determine whether there is a difference between Islamic mutual funds and conventional mutual funds. Testing the H1 hypothesis with the Paires sample t-test in 2016-2018 shows the results that all probability values are> 0.05.

Meanwhile, hypothesis H2 testing was carried out using the paired sample t-test with a significant level of  $\alpha$  = 0.05 for two independent samples and to determine whether there is a difference between Islamic mutual funds and conventional mutual funds. Testing the H2 hypothesis with Paires sample t-test in 2016-2018 shows the results that all probability values are> 0.05.

## CONCLUSION

This study concludes that there is a significant difference between Islamic equity funds and conventional equity funds and Islamic mutual funds and traditional mutual funds.

## REFERENCES

- 1. Darmadji dan Fakhruddin. 2012. Pasar modal di Indonesia.Salemba Empat, Jakarta.
- 2. Hayati, Neuneung Ratna dan Haruman, Tendi. 2006. Analisis Perbandingan Kinerja Reksadana Konvesional dan Reksadana Syariah Sebagai Dasar Pengetahuan Bagi Pengambilan Keputusan Investasi Di Pasar Modal Indonesia. Seminar 52 Knowlegde Management, KKMI FTI ITB. Fakultas Bisnis Dan Manajemen Universitas Widyatama
- 3. Otoritas Jasa Keuangan.(2019).Pasar Modal.In O.J.Keuangan,Buku III : Pasar Modal (p.22).Jakarta
- 4. PT Bursa Efek Indonesia. (2019, September 12). Produk : ReksadanaRetrievedFromReksadana:http://www.idx.co.id/produk/reksa-dana/
- 5. Sunariyah, 2006. Pengantar Pengetahuan Pasar Modal, edisi ke lima, UPPAMP YKPN, Yogyakarta